The formation of massive, quiescent galaxies at cosmic noon

Robert Feldmann,1* Philip F. Hopkins,2 Eliot Quataert,1 Claude-André Faucher-Giguère3 and Dušan Kereš4
1Department of Astronomy, University of California, Berkeley, CA 94720-3411, USA
2TAPIR 350-17, California Institute of Technology, Pasadena, CA 91125, USA
3Department of Physics and Astronomy and CIERA, Northwestern University, Evanston, IL 60208, USA
4Center for Astrophysics and Space Sciences, University of California, San Diego, CA 92093, USA

Accepted 2016 January 19. Received 2016 January 18; in original form 2015 November 24

ABSTRACT
The cosmic noon ($z \sim 1.5–3$) marked a period of vigorous star formation for most galaxies. However, about a third of the more massive galaxies at those times were quiescent in the sense that their observed stellar populations are inconsistent with rapid star formation. The reduced star formation activity is often attributed to gaseous outflows driven by feedback from supermassive black holes, but the impact of black hole feedback on galaxies in the young Universe is not yet definitively established. We analyse the origin of quiescent galaxies with the help of ultrahigh resolution, cosmological simulations that include feedback from stars but do not model the uncertain consequences of black hole feedback. We show that dark matter haloes with specific accretion rates below $\sim 0.25–0.4$ Gyr$^{-1}$ preferentially host galaxies with reduced star formation rates and red broad-band colours. The fraction of such haloes in large dark matter only simulations matches the observed fraction of massive quiescent galaxies ($\sim 10^{10}–10^{11} \, M_\odot$). This strongly suggests that halo accretion rate is the key parameter determining which massive galaxies at $z \sim 1.5–3$ become quiescent. Empirical models that connect galaxy and halo evolution, such as galaxy and halo occupation distribution or abundance matching models, assume a tight link between galaxy properties and the masses of their parent haloes. These models will benefit from adding the specific accretion rate of haloes as a second model parameter.

Key words: galaxies: evolution – galaxies: formation – galaxies: high-redshift – galaxies: star formation.

1 INTRODUCTION
There is mounting evidence that star formation in galaxies is tied to the accretion of gas from intergalactic distances (e.g. Dekel et al. 2009; Cresci et al. 2010; Lilly et al. 2013; Martin et al. 2014; Sánchez Almeida et al. 2014; Brisbin et al. 2015; Narayanan et al. 2015; Rodriguez-Puebla et al. 2016). Hence, reduced gas accretion on to galaxies could potentially be responsible for the reduced star formation rates (SFRs) of quiescent galaxies (Feldmann & Mayer 2015). The reduced supply of gas to galaxies and haloes would also make it easier for additional processes, e.g. black hole feedback (e.g. Ciotti & Ostriker 1997; Di Matteo, Springel & Hernquist 2005; Sijacki & Springel 2006; Teyssier et al. 2011; Kormendy & Ho 2013), to fully suppress any remaining star formation activity in quiescent galaxies (Cattaneo et al. 2006; Dekel & Birnboim 2006). Numerical simulations are the tool of choice to test this proposed picture, but until now no existing simulation produced both a galaxy sample of the necessary size for statistical analysis and properly resolved and modelled the relevant physical processes that take place in galaxies at $z \sim 1.5–3$. In addition, cosmological, hydrodynamical simulations have a long history of struggling to reproduce key properties of observed galaxies such as their typical stellar masses and SFRs (Scannapieco et al. 2012). This study, MassiveFIRE, overcomes these challenges by adopting the accurate physical modelling of the Feedback In Realistic Environments (FIRE) project (Hopkins et al. 2014) and by applying it, for the first time, to a population of massive galaxies.

We have simulated the evolution of 35 massive galaxies for the first 4 billion yr after the Big Bang (until redshift $z \geq 1.67$). The galaxy sample is extracted from 17 distinct sub-regions, each containing at least one dark matter (DM) halo with a mass in the range $3 \times 10^{12}–3 \times 10^{13} \, M_\odot$, embedded in a representative volume of the Universe. The sub-regions sample the full range of cosmological assembly histories of haloes harbouring massive galaxies, i.e. galaxies with stellar masses larger than about $10^{10} \, M_\odot$. Our simulations are run with the hydrodynamics and gravity solver GIZMO (Hopkins 2015) at ultrahigh spatial ($\sim 10$ pc) and mass resolution...
relation is about 0.2 dex (Reddick et al. 2013, shaded region). Satellite galaxies tend to lie to the left of the relation as their DM haloes are often tidally stripped. MassiveFIRE galaxies have stellar masses in fair agreement with the empirically derived SHMR.

2 RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Fig. 1 compares the stellar masses of MassiveFIRE galaxies with those of actual galaxies that reside in DM haloes of similar mass. Stellar masses of MassiveFIRE galaxies agree, to within a factor of ~2, with the empirically inferred estimate of the SHMR (Moster, Naab & White 2013) at \( z = 2 \) and its extrapolation to higher redshifts. We note, however, that the exact functional form of the SHMR relation differs somewhat among studies (Behroozi, Wechsler & Conroy 2013; Moster, Naab & White 2013; Garrison-Kimmel et al. 2014).

Figure 2 shows four typical example galaxies from MassiveFIRE. Each panel displays a composite image (in rest-frame \( U, V, \) and \( J \) broad-band filters) of the dust reprocessed star light. Following conventional practice (Wuyts et al. 2007; Williams et al. 2009; Whitaker et al. 2011) we classify galaxies as quiescent based on their \( U-V \) and \( V-J \) broad-band colours; specifically, if \( U - V > 1.2, V - J < 1.4, \) and \( U - V > 0.88 \times (V - J) + 0.59 \). Our sample contains 8 quiescent and 15 star-forming central galaxies (galaxies that dominate the central potential well of their host DM halo), and 4 quiescent and 8 star-forming satellites (galaxies orbiting a central galaxy). Star-forming galaxies have younger stellar populations than quiescent galaxies, resulting in bluer intrinsic colours, although interspersed dust lanes extinct and redden the light along particular lines of sight (see top panels of Fig. 2). Fortunately, the colour-colour classification is relatively insensitive to the amount of dust reddening. Most star-forming galaxies in our sample have a late-type morphology with either large stellar and gas discs (half-mass radii > 3 kpc) or irregular shapes, in agreement with observations (Lee et al. 2013). In contrast, quiescent galaxies often have an early-type morphology with a more compact stellar distribution (van der Wel et al. 2014) and contain only low levels of dust and cold gas (bottom row of Fig. 2).

The specific SFR for both star-forming and quiescent galaxies in the MassiveFIRE sample is shown in Fig. 3. We measure the specific SFR in 5 kpc radii to roughly mimic aperture based flux measurements. Stellar feedback processes, such as energy and momentum injection from supernovae, stellar winds, photo-heating, and radiation pressure, interact in a non-linear manner (Hopkins, Quataert & Murray 2012) and are all included in our simulations with little reliance on tunable parameters. Feedback from supermassive black holes is not included. We will present the setup and methodology of our simulations in more detail in Feldmann et al. (in preparation).

We showed in previous work that the computational approach of this Letter reproduces well the integral properties of lower mass galaxies (\( M^* \lesssim 3 \times 10^{10} \) M\(_\odot\)) since cosmic noon. For instance, we reported on the stellar-to-halo-mass relation (SHMR; Hopkins et al. 2014), on the stellar mass–metallicity relation (Ma et al. 2016), and on the properties of galactic outflows driven by stellar feedback (Muratov et al. 2015) finding good agreement with available observations. We also showed that the \( H_I \) covering fractions in \( \lesssim 10^{12} \) M\(_\odot\) haloes at cosmic noon match observations (Faucher-Giguère et al. 2014). We will report corresponding properties of MassiveFIRE galaxies in upcoming work.

### Figure 1

Stellar-to-halo-mass relation (SHMR) of MassiveFIRE galaxies at \( z = 2 \) (green circles), \( z = 5 \) (purple circles), and \( z = 9 \) (cyan circles). Central (satellite) galaxies at each redshift are shown by filled (empty) circles, and large (small) circles denote galaxies simulated at high (medium) numerical resolution. Dotted lines show an empirical estimate (Moster et al. 2013) of the SHMR and its extrapolation to high redshifts and low stellar masses. The \( - \sigma \) scatter of individual galaxies above and below the mean relation is about 0.2 dex (Reddick et al. 2013, shaded region). Satellite galaxies tend to lie to the left of the relation as their DM haloes are often tidally stripped. MassiveFIRE galaxies have stellar masses in fair agreement with the empirically derived SHMR.

### Figure 2

Colour-composite images of four central galaxies in the MassiveFIRE sample as they would appear in rest-frame \( U, V, \) and \( J \) bands ~4 billion yr after the Big Bang (\( z = 1.67 \)). Galaxies are shown face-on with each image spanning 30 kpc on each side. (Top left): a star-forming, disc galaxy; (top right): a star-forming, irregular galaxy; (bottom row): two examples of quiescent, early-type galaxies. Star-forming and quiescent galaxies differ in their colours, morphologies, and levels of dust extinction.

### Figure 3

Massive, quiescent galaxies at cosmic noon L15

\( m_{\text{gas}} = 3.3 \times 10^4 \) M\(_\odot\) at high resolution, \( 2.7 \times 10^5 \) M\(_\odot\) at medium resolution) in P-SPH mode. The high numerical resolution allows us to model reliably many of the relevant processes that take place in the interstellar medium of galaxies. Stellar feedback processes, such as energy and momentum injection from supernovae, stellar winds, photo-heating, and radiation pressure, interact in a non-linear manner (Hopkins, Quataert & Murray 2012) and are all included in our simulations with little reliance on tunable parameters. Feedback from supermassive black holes is not included. We will present the setup and methodology of our simulations in more detail in Feldmann et al. (in preparation).

We showed in previous work that the computational approach of this Letter reproduces well the integral properties of lower mass galaxies (\( M^* \lesssim 3 \times 10^{10} \) M\(_\odot\)) since cosmic noon. For instance, we reported on the stellar-to-halo-mass relation (SHMR; Hopkins et al. 2014), on the stellar mass–metallicity relation (Ma et al. 2016), and on the properties of galactic outflows driven by stellar feedback (Muratov et al. 2015) finding good agreement with available observations. We also showed that the \( H_I \) covering fractions in \( \lesssim 10^{12} \) M\(_\odot\) haloes at cosmic noon match observations (Faucher-Giguère et al. 2014). We will report corresponding properties of MassiveFIRE galaxies in upcoming work.

2 RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Fig. 1 compares the stellar masses of MassiveFIRE galaxies with those of actual galaxies that reside in DM haloes of similar mass.
lower rates than in star-forming galaxies of comparable stellar mass. Sequence. Star formation in quiescent galaxies, however, proceeds at much lower rates than in star-forming galaxies with specific SFRs consistent with the observed star-forming sequence. Star formation in quiescent galaxies, however, proceeds at much lower rates than in star-forming galaxies of comparable stellar mass.

measurements (Whitaker et al. 2011; Schreiber et al. 2015) and to minimize potential contributions from low-mass satellite galaxies. Specific SFRs change typically by less than 0.1 dex if measured within a radius of 0.1 $R_{vir}$ instead. Star-forming galaxies at cosmic noon have high specific SFRs of the order of 1 Gyr$^{-1}$, while quiescent galaxies form stars at significantly lower specific rates. We note that, in most cases, the SFRs of galaxies classified as quiescent remain low for extended periods of time ($>3 \times 10^8$ yr). The specific SFRs of MassiveFIRE galaxies are in good agreement with observations (Brammer et al. 2011; Schreiber et al. 2015).

We fit the growth history of the (cold) baryonic mass ($M_{bar} = M_{HI} + M_{H$_2$} + M_\star$) of each galaxy with a modified exponential $\propto (1+z)^{e^{-z/\Delta z}}$ over an extended redshift range starting from $z = 7$ down to either the final simulation snapshot or to the last snapshot at which the galaxy is still a central, whichever comes first. Gas and stars within 10 per cent of the virial radius from the centre of a galaxy are considered part of that galaxy. Our results do not change qualitatively if we use a 50 per cent larger or smaller radius instead. We similarly fit the growth of the DM mass, $M_{DM}$, contained within the virial radius of the haloes surrounding these galaxies. In Fig. 4, we plot $d\ln M_{bar}/dt$ and $d\ln M_{DM}/dt$ for both star-forming and quiescent galaxies in MassiveFIRE, linking the growth of DM haloes to the growth of galaxies residing at the centres of those haloes. The figure demonstrates that most galaxies at cosmic noon grow on the same time-scale as the DM haloes they live in, complementing previous work that showed that baryonic masses and DM masses of haloes assemble on similar time-scales (Faucher-Giguère, Kereš & Ma 2011). This is a non-trivial result as galaxies contain only a small fraction, less than a fifth, of the baryons in haloes (Papastergis et al. 2012).

At cosmic noon, galaxies with declining SFRs are on their way to becoming quiescent. Hence, we may introduce an alternative definition of ‘quiescence’ that is not based on broad-band colours, but on the star formation history of galaxies. In particular, by manipulating the standard equations for one-zone galaxy models including inflow, outflow, star formation, and gas build up (e.g. Lilly et al. 2013; Feldmann 2015), the condition of a declining SFR can be shown to be equivalent to $d\ln M_{bar}/dt \sim X_{crit} = 1 - R + \omega dm_{dep}/dt/[\omega dm_{dep} + sSFR^{-1}]$. Here, $m_{dep} = (M_{HI} + M_{H$_2$})/SFR$ is the gas depletion time, $R$ is the return fraction of gas from evolved stellar populations, and $sSFR(t) = SFR/M_\star = A \times sSFR_{MS}(M_\star(t), t)$ is the specific SFR. $sSFR_{MS}$ is the specific SFR of galaxies of the same mass on the star-forming sequence and $A$ can be derived from the criticality condition $sSFR/\omega dm_{dep}/dt = 0$. Upon inserting values appropriate for galaxies in the $M_\star \sim 10^{10}$–$10^{11}$ $M_\odot$ range at cosmic noon, we find that such galaxies should be reducing their star formation activity, and thus becoming quiescent, when $d\ln M_{bar}/dt \lesssim 0.25$–0.4 Gyr$^{-1}$.

In agreement with this analysis, $d\ln M_{bar}/dt \sim 0.4$ Gyr$^{-1}$ largely separates star forming from quiescent galaxies in the MassiveFIRE sample, as shown in Fig. 4. As galaxies and haloes grow on very similar time-scales (see Fig. 4), we can re-interpret this result in terms of the specific growth rates of DM haloes, i.e. $d\ln M_{DM}/dt \lesssim 0.4$ Gyr$^{-1}$
is a necessary condition for a halo to host a quiescent galaxy at its centre. The link between star formation and halo accretion is particularly clear in the steady state approximation of galaxy evolution (Bouché et al. 2010), where SFR $\sim \dot{M}_{\text{gas,in}}/dt \propto \dot{M}_{\text{DM}}/dt$, and thus sSFR $\sim \ln \dot{M}_{\text{DM}}/dt$ (Lilly et al. 2013). We propose that the majority of moderately massive, quiescent galaxies in the young Universe form via this mechanism, i.e. they reside in the sub-set of haloes that accrete gas from the cosmic web at such low rates that they cannot maintain SFRs characteristic of typical star-forming galaxies (Schreiber et al. 2015). As discussed more below, numerous haloes undergoing such ‘cosmological starvation’ (Feldmann & Mayer 2015) should exist given the variations in the gravity-driven collapse histories of DM haloes (McBride, Fakhouri & Ma 2009).

35 per cent of the central galaxies and 34 per cent of all galaxies in our sample are quiescent. These numbers compare favourably with observations of quiescent fractions of 25–50 per cent over a broad stellar mass range (Muzzin et al. 2013; Tomczak et al. 2014); see Fig. 5. We note that the cumulative fraction of quiescent galaxies in MassiveFIRE is lower at larger stellar masses, while the observed fraction remains relatively flat. This difference could point towards missing physics in our simulations, such as black hole feedback, or it could be an artefact related to the low number of galaxies (two) in our highest halo mass bin. Hence, whether cosmological starvation is an effective quenching mechanisms for galaxies residing in the most massive haloes at $z = 2$ ($M_\text{vir} > 10^{13} M_\odot$, $\sigma < 5 \times 10^{-5} \text{ Mpc}^{-1}$) remains to be studied in future work.

Fig. 5 also plots the fraction of haloes with low specific growth rates based on a large-volume cosmological $N$-body simulation (Springel et al. 2005; McBride et al. 2009). The fraction of haloes with $\ln \dot{M}_{\text{DM}}/dt < -0.9$ matches fairly well the observed quiescent fraction. The former declines slightly towards the largest stellar masses, indicating that additional physics besides cosmological starvation is likely involved in shutting down star formation in the most massive galaxies ($M_* > 10^{11} M_\odot$). Fig. 4 shows that there is overlap between star-forming and quiescent galaxies at intermediate specific growth rates. We find that the fraction of slowly accreting haloes still matches the observed fraction of quiescent galaxies even if a sizable fraction of such haloes, e.g. a third, host star-forming galaxies.

**3 CONCLUSIONS**

The star formation activity of massive galaxies in a young Universe is ultimately fuelled by the accretion of intergalactic gas (Kereš et al. 2005; Dekel et al. 2009; Davé et al. 2010; Nelson et al. 2013). By limiting the supply of gas to galaxies and haloes, cosmological starvation makes it easier for additional processes, e.g. feedback from black holes, to fully counteract hot gas cooling and to heat or eject any remaining cool gas. Cosmological starvation thus enables the formation of quiescent galaxies with red broadband colours and reduced SFRs at cosmic noon. However, it may be a necessary but not a sufficient condition for completely shutting down star formation in such galaxies.

The different accretion histories of quiescent and star-forming galaxies in haloes of the same mass have a number of observational consequences. First, as quiescent galaxies are assembled earlier, they will be surrounded by more evolved satellite populations. In particular, orbital decay and tidal stripping (Zentner et al. 2005) should reduce the number of satellites of a given stellar mass, and the longer exposure (Feldmann, Carollo & Mayer 2011) to the hot atmospheres of massive galaxies may explain the increased fraction of satellites with low SFRs (Weinmann et al. 2006). Secondly, we expect that the dominant haloes of overdense environments should have large accretion rates and, thus, should host vigorously star-forming galaxies. In contrast, quiescent galaxies at those redshifts should preferentially reside in average or below average environments. This idea is corroborated by our finding that 50 per cent (25 per cent) of the quiescent central galaxies versus 13 per cent (73 per cent) of the star-forming central galaxies in our sample reside in the lower (upper) quartile of the local environment density. Thirdly, the clustering of haloes of a given mass depends on their formation time, the so-called assembly bias (Wechsler et al. 2006). As massive DM haloes are less clustered if they collapsed earlier, we predict that massive, quiescent galaxies at cosmic noon have a lower clustering amplitude than star-forming galaxies residing within haloes of the same mass. Finally, we speculate that age-matching (Hearin & Watson 2013), an empirical correlation between galaxy colours and halo formation time, has its physical origin in cosmological starvation.

**ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

RF was supported in part by NASA through Hubble Fellowship grant HF2-51304.001-A awarded by the Space Telescope Science Institute, which is operated by the Association of Universities for
Research in Astronomy, Inc., for NASA, under contract NAS 5-26555, in part by the Theoretical Astrophysics Center at UC Berkeley, and by NASA ATP grant 12-ATP-120183. Support for PFH was provided by an Alfred P. Sloan Research Fellowship, NASA ATP Grant NNX14AJ35G, and NSF Collaborative Research Grant #1411920 and CAREER grant #1455342. CAFG was supported by NSF through grants AST-1412836 and AST-1517491, by NASA through grant NNX15AB22G, and by Northwestern University funds. DK was supported by NSF grant AST-1412153. Support for EQ was provided by an Alfred P. Sloan Research Fellowship, NASA ATP Grant NNX14AH35G, and NSF Collaborative Research Grant #1417491. Additional computing support was provided by HEC allocation SMD-14-5492 and NSF XSEDE allocation TG-AST120025.

REFERENCES

Narayan D. et al., 2015, Nature, 525, 496
Springel V. et al., 2005, Nature, 435, 629

This paper has been typeset from a TEX/LATEX file prepared by the author.